

1 MICHAEL F. HERTZ  
 Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
 2 JOSEPH H. HUNT  
 ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
 3 PAUL E. AHERN  
 U.S. Department of Justice  
 4 Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
 5 20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Rm. 6102  
 Washington, D.C. 20001  
 6 Tel: (202) 514-4782/Fax: (202) 616-8460  
 7 *Attorneys for Government Defendants*

ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION  
 CINDY COHN (145997)  
 LEE TIEN (148216)  
 KURT OPSAHL (191303)  
 KEVIN S. BANKSTON (217026)  
 JAMES S. TYRE (083117)  
 454 Shotwell Street  
 San Francisco, CA 94110  
 Telephone: (415) 436-9333  
 Fax: (415) 436-9993

8 ANN M. RAVEL  
 Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
 9 TIMOTHY P. GARREN  
 ANDREA W. MCCARTHY  
 10 JAMES R. WHITMAN  
 U.S. Department of Justice  
 11 Civil Division, Torts Branch  
 12 P.O. Box 7146, Ben Franklin Station  
 Washington, DC 20044-7146  
 13 Tel: (202) 616-4169/Fax: (202) 616-4314  
 14 *Attorneys for Individual Capacity Defendants*

RICHARD R. WIEBE (121156)  
 LAW OFFICE OF RICHARD R. WIEBE  
 425 California Street, Suite 2025  
 San Francisco, CA 94104  
 Telephone: (415) 433-3200  
 Fax: (415) 433-6382  
  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

15  
 16 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
 17 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**  
 18 **SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

19  
 20 **CAROLYN JEWEL *et al.*,** )  
 )  
 21 ***Plaintiffs,*** )  
 )  
 22 **v.** )  
 )  
 23 **NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY *et al.*,** )  
 )  
 24 ***Defendants*** )  
 )  
 25 )  
 26 )  
 27 )

**Case No. C:08-cv-4373-VRW**  
  
**EXHIBIT 1 TO**  
**JOINT MOTION FOR ENTRY OF**  
**ORDER REGARDING**  
**PRESERVATION OF EVIDENCE**  
  
**DKT. 393 IN 06-CV-1791-VRW**  
  
**Chief Judge Vaughn R. Walker**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN RE: MDL Docket No 06-1791 VRW  
NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY ORDER  
TELECOMMUNICATIONS RECORDS  
LITIGATION

This Document Relates To:  
ALL CASES

\_\_\_\_\_ /

Plaintiffs have moved for an order prohibiting the alteration or destruction of evidence during the pendency of this action. MDL Doc # 384. The United States has filed papers opposing the motion, Doc # 386, and has prepared and lodged with the court a confidential submission designed for ex parte, in camera review. Doc # 387. Telephone company defendants AT&T, Cingular, Bellsouth, Sprint and Verizon have joined in the United States's opposition to plaintiffs' motion. Doc # 365, 388, 390.

Upon careful review of the non-confidential papers submitted in support of and in opposition to the motion, the court

1 has determined that (1) no hearing on the motion is necessary; (2)  
2 an order requiring the preservation of evidence is appropriate; and  
3 (3) an interim order shall forthwith enter requiring the parties to  
4 take steps to prevent the alteration or destruction of evidence as  
5 follows:

6           A. Until the issues in these proceedings can be further  
7 refined in light of the guidance and directives anticipated to be  
8 received upon appellate review of the court's decision in Hepting v  
9 AT&T Corporation, 439 F Supp 974 (N D Cal 2006) and of the Oregon  
10 district court's decision in Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc v  
11 Bush, 451 F Supp 2d 1215 (D Or 2006), the court reminds all parties  
12 of their duty to preserve evidence that may be relevant to this  
13 action. The duty extends to documents, data and tangible things in  
14 the possession, custody and control of the parties to this action,  
15 and any employees, agents, contractors, carriers, bailees or other  
16 non-parties who possess materials reasonably anticipated to be  
17 subject to discovery in this action. Counsel are under an  
18 obligation to exercise efforts to identify and notify such non-  
19 parties, including employees of corporate or institutional parties.

20           B. "Documents, data and tangible things" is to be  
21 interpreted broadly to include writings, records, files,  
22 correspondence, reports, memoranda, calendars, diaries, minutes,  
23 electronic messages, voicemail, e-mail, telephone message records  
24 or logs, computer and network activity logs, hard drives, backup  
25 data, removable computer storage media such as tapes, disks and  
26 cards, printouts, document image files, web pages, databases,  
27 spreadsheets, software, books, ledgers, journals, orders, invoices,  
28 bills, vouchers, checks, statements, worksheets, summaries,

1 compilations, computations, charts, diagrams, graphic  
2 presentations, drawings, films, digital or chemical process  
3 photographs, video, phonographic, tape or digital recordings or  
4 transcripts thereof, drafts, jottings and notes. Information that  
5 serves to identify, locate, or link such material, such as file  
6 inventories, file folders, indices and metadata, is also included  
7 in this definition.

8 C. "Preservation" is to be interpreted broadly to  
9 accomplish the goal of maintaining the integrity of all documents,  
10 data and tangible things reasonably anticipated to be subject to  
11 discovery under FRCP 26, 45 and 56(e) in this action. Preservation  
12 includes taking reasonable steps to prevent the partial or full  
13 destruction, alteration, testing, deletion, shredding,  
14 incineration, wiping, relocation, migration, theft, or mutation of  
15 such material, as well as negligent or intentional handling that  
16 would make material incomplete or inaccessible.

17 D. Counsel are directed to inquire of their respective  
18 clients if the business practices of any party involve the routine  
19 destruction, recycling, relocation, or mutation os such materials  
20 and, if so, direct the party, to the extent practicable for the  
21 pendency of this order, either to

22 (1) halt such business processes;

23 (2) sequester or remove such material from the business  
24 process; or

25 (3) arrange for the preservation of complete and accurate  
26 duplicates or copies of such material, suitable for later discovery  
27 if requested.

28 \\  
\\

