

1 ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION
 CINDY COHN (145997)
 2 cindy@eff.org
 LEE TIEN (148216)
 3 tien@eff.org
 KURT OPSAHL (191303)
 4 kurt@eff.org
 KEVIN S. BANKSTON (217026)
 5 bankston@eff.org
 CORYNNE MCSHERRY (221504)
 6 corynne@eff.org
 JAMES S. TYRE (083117)
 7 jstyre@eff.org
 454 Shotwell Street
 8 San Francisco, CA 94110
 Telephone: 415/436-9333
 9 415/436-9993 (fax)

10 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

11 [Additional counsel appear on signature page.]

12

13

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

14

FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

15

SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

16

IN RE NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY)
 TELECOMMUNICATIONS RECORDS)
 17 LITIGATION, MDL No. 1791)

MDL Docket No 06-1791 VRW

Relates to Case No. C-06-0672-VRW

18

This Document Relates To:

CLASS ACTION

19

Hepting, et. al v. AT&T Corporation, et. al)

**PLAINTIFFS' STATUS REPORT
 PURSUANT TO AUGUST 14, 2006
 ORDER**

20

21

22

Courtroom: 6, 17th Floor
 Judge: The Hon. Vaughn R. Walker

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 Pursuant to the Court's Order of August 14, 2006 (C-06-0672-VRW Dkt. 336), plaintiffs
2 provide the following:

3 **A. Status of 28 USC § 1407 transfers pursuant to MDL 1791.**

4 As this Court is aware, on August 10, 2006, the Judicial Panel on Multi-District Litigation
5 transferred 17 cases docketed with the panel under MDL 1791 to this Court. According to the
6 docket in MDL 06-1791-VRW, the Northern District Clerk's Office has received the case files in
7 14 of these actions, including *Hepting*, as of September 15, 2006. On August 31, 2006, the MDL
8 panel conditionally transferred an additional 21 "tag-along" cases to this Court, subject to
9 oppositions to transfer being filed with the panel by parties to those cases. Two of the transferred
10 cases have since been dismissed (*Potter v. Bellsouth* (M.D. Tenn.) and *Tyler v. AT&T et. al* (D.
11 Neb.)). Any notice of opposition to the transfer of a tag-along case must be filed with the MDL
12 panel by September 15, 2006.

13 Two of the conditionally transferred tag-along cases are solely against the government and
14 are not also brought against telecommunications companies. Those are *Al-Haramain Islamic*
15 *Foundation v. Bush* (D. Ore.) and *CCR v. Bush* (S.D. N.Y.). *Al-Haramain* has been the subject of
16 an Order by the District Court denying the government's motion on state secrets grounds to dismiss
17 or, in the alternative, for summary judgment; the Court certified its order for interlocutory appeal
18 pursuant to §1292(b). *Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc. v. Bush*, 2006 WL 2583425 (D. Ore.
19 Sept. 7, 2006). The deadline for the government to petition for review by the 9th Circuit has not yet
20 passed. The *CCR* case has been fully briefed and oral argument held on the government's motion
21 to dismiss or in the alternative for summary judgment based upon the states secrets privilege and
22 on a cross motion for summary judgment brought by the plaintiffs.

23 On September 12, 2006, Defendant AT&T notified the MDL panel that it considered five
24 additional cases arising out of administrative subpoenas issued by Attorneys General and Public
25 Utilities Commissioners in several states (New Jersey, Missouri (2 cases), Maine, Connecticut) to
26 be potential tag-alongs in this litigation.

27 Plaintiffs' counsel for the transferred cases have been conferring and believe that they can
28 present a Joint and Agreed Organization and Case Management Plan in advance of a case

1 management conference set for a time at the court's earliest convenience. Unlike some multi-
2 defendant MDL proceedings in which all defendants are alleged to have acted in concert, these
3 cases involve numerous separate defendants who have each acted independently. The factual
4 allegations of each case, and the legal consequences of those facts in light of the Court's July 20,
5 2006 Order (C-06-0672-VRW Dkt. #308), vary tremendously. Accordingly, plaintiffs anticipate
6 that the MDL proceedings will best be managed by coordinating rather than consolidating all of the
7 cases.

8 **B. Interlocutory Appeal Petitions of the Government and AT&T**

9 The 28 U.S.C. § 1292(b) interlocutory appeal petitions of the Government and AT&T, and
10 the cross-petition of plaintiffs, are still pending before the 9th Circuit. As of the date of this filing,
11 no action has yet been taken on them.

12 **C. Plaintiffs' Pending Motion For Preliminary Injunction**

13 Plaintiffs filed their pending motion for a preliminary injunction on March 31, 2006, nearly
14 six months ago (C-06-0672-VRW Dkt # 16). As the parties and the Court discussed at length
15 during the hearing on August 8, 2006, plaintiffs seek to move forward with their pending
16 preliminary injunction motion as quickly as possible. To that end, plaintiffs propose the following
17 occur once the current stay expires on September 29, 2006:

18 First, the discovery previously noticed by plaintiffs in support of their preliminary
19 injunction motion should go forward. To the extent that this discovery implicates the government's
20 state secrets concerns, it should proceed under the procedures outlined by the Court in its July 20,
21 2006 Order, including appointment of a Court expert or consultant pursuant to F.R.E. 706 as
22 discussed during the August 8, 2006 hearing, as well as under the processes outlined in 50 U.S.C.
23 § 1806(f). To the extent that plaintiffs seek information that does not implicate state secret
24 concerns (e.g., public statements by AT&T), discovery related to the injunction should go forward
25 as it would in any other case.

26 Second, the Court should set a briefing schedule and early hearing date for plaintiffs'
27 preliminary injunction motion. This briefing schedule should accommodate the discovery that
28 plaintiffs seek in support of their motion and the filing of an answer by the AT&T defendants, with

1 the answer also filed under the procedures discussed in the Court's July 20, 2006, Order and 50
2 U.S.C. § 1806(f).

3
4 DATED: September 15, 2006

ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION

5
6 By _____ /s/
7 Cindy A. Cohn, Esq. (SBN 145997)
8 Lee Tien, Esq. (SBN 148216)
9 Kurt Opsahl, Esq. (SBN 191303)
10 Kevin S. Bankston, Esq. (SBN 217026)
11 Corynne McSherry, Esq. (SBN 221504)
12 James S. Tyre, Esq. (SBN 083117)
13 454 Shotwell Street
14 San Francisco, CA 94110
15 Telephone: (415) 436-9333 x108
16 Facsimile: (415) 436-9993

17 ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS

18 Additional Plaintiffs' Counsel:

19 LERACH COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER
20 RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP
21 ERIC ALAN ISAACSON
22 655 West Broadway, Suite 1900
23 San Diego, CA 92101-3301
24 Telephone: (619) 231-1058
25 Facsimile: (619) 231-7423

26 LERACH COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER
27 RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP
28 REED R. KATHREIN
JEFF D. FRIEDMAN
MARIA V. MORRIS
SHANA E. SCARLETT
100 Pine Street, Suite 2600
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 288-4545
Facsimile: (415) 288-4534

TRABER & VOORHEES
BERT VOORHEES
THERESA M. TRABER
128 North Fair Oaks Avenue, Suite 204
Pasadena, CA 91103
Telephone: (626) 585-9611
Facsimile: (626) 577-7079

LAW OFFICE OF RICHARD R. WIEBE
RICHARD R. WIEBE
425 California Street, Suite 2025
San Francisco, CA 94104
Telephone: (415) 433-3200
Facsimile: (415) 433-6382

LAW OFFICE OF ARAM ANTARAMIAN
ARAM ANTARAMIAN
1714 Blake Street
Berkeley, CA 94703
Telephone: (510) 841-2369

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on September 15, 2006, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the e-mail addresses denoted on the attached Electronic Mail Notice List, and I hereby certify that I have mailed the foregoing document or paper via the United States Postal Service to the non-CM/ECF participants listed on the following pages.

By _____ /s/
Cindy A. Cohn, Esq. (SBN.145997)
ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION
454 Shotwell Street
San Francisco, CA 94110
Telephone: (415) 436-9333 x108
Facsimile: (415) 436-9993
cindy@eff.org

1 David L. Anderson
2 Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP
3 50 Fremont Street
Post Office Box 7880
San Francisco, CA 94120-7880

David W. Carpenter
Sidley Austin Brown & Wood LLP
Bank One Plaza
10 South Dearborn Street
Chicago, IL 60600

4 Darrell Lee Barger
5 Hartline acus et all
6 800 N. Shoreline Blvd.
Suite 2000N
Corpus Christi, TX 78401

Edward Morgan Carstarphen, III
Ellis Carstearphen et all
5847 San Felipe
Suite 1900
Houston, TX 77057

7 Marc Oliver Beem
8 Miller Shakman & Hamilton, LLP
9 180 North LaSalle Street
Suite 3600
Chicago, IL 60601

Catherine J. Casey
DLA Piper rudnick Gray Cary US LLP
203 North LaSalle Street
#1900
Chicago, IL 60601

10 John Beisner
11 O'Melveny & Myers LLP
12 555 13th Street, N.W.
Suite 500 West
Washington, DC 20004-1109

Amato A. DeLuca
DeLuca & Weizenbaum, Ltd.
199 North Main Street
Providence, RI 02903

13 Steven K. Blackhurst
14 Ater Wynne Hewitt Dodson & Skerritt
15 222 S.W. Columbia Ste 1800
Portland, OR 97201-6618

Nancy Scott Degan
Baker Donelson Bearman Caldwell &
Berkowitz, PC
201 St. Charle Avenue
Suite 3600
New Orleans, LA 70170

16 David Blair-Loy
17 ACLU Foundation of San Diego/Imperial
18 Counties
P.O. Box 87131
San Diego, CA 92138

Val Patrick Exnicios
Liska Exnicios & Nungesser
One Canal Place
365 Canal Street
New Orleans, LA 70130

19 D. Douglas Brothers
20 George & Brothers
110 Norwood Tower
115 West 7th Street
Suite 1100
21 Austin, TX 78701

Tyrone C. Fahner
Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw LLP
71 South Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606

22 James M. Carlson
23 Ungaretti & Harris LLP
3500 Three First National Plaza
Chicago, IL 60602

Daniel Martin Feeney
Miller Shakman & Beem LLP
180 North LaSalle Street
Suite 3600
Chicago, IL 60601

24 David R. Carpenter
25 Sidley Austin LLP
26 One South Dearborn Street
Chicago, IL 60603

Sheila Marie Finnegan
Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw LLP
71 South Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606

27
28

1 Jodi W. Flowers
2 Motley Rice, LLC
3 28 Bridgeside Boulevard
4 P.O. Box 1792
5 Mount Pleasant, SC 29465

6 Amy Collins Fontenot
7 Liska, Exnicios & Nungesser
8 One Canal Place
9 365 Canal Street
10 Suite 2290
11 New Orleans, LA 70130

12 Zachary J. Freeman
13 Miller Shakman & Beem LLP
14 180 N. La Salle Street
15 Suite 3600
16 Chicago, IL 60601

17 Susan A. Freiwald
18 USF School of LAW
19 2130 Fulton St
20 San Francisco, CA 94117

21 Daniel N. Gall
22 c/o Luna Innocations
23 2851 Commerce Street
24 Blacksburg, VA 24060

25 F. Thomas Hecht
26 Ungaretti & Harris LLP
27 3500 Three First National Plaza
28 Chicago, IL 60602

Anthony D. Irpino
Irpino Law Firm
365 Canal Street
22nd Floor
New Orleans, LA 70130

Joseph G. Jevic, III
St. Martin & Williams
4084 Highway 311
P.O. Box 2017
Houma, LA 70361-2017

Philip J. John, Jr
Baker & Botts
One Shell Plaza
910 Louisiana Street
Houston, TX 77002

C. J. Johnson
Kalkstein Law Firm
P.O. Box 8568
Missoula, MT 59807

Joshua Karsh
Gessler Hughes Piers Resnick & Dym Ltd.
Three First National Plaza
70 West Madison Street, Suite 4000
Chicago, IL 60602

Peter D. Keisler
United States Department of Justice
Assistant Attorney General
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Room 7312
Washington, DC 20530

Jonathan D. King
DLA Piper Rudnick Gray Cary US LLP
203 North LaSalle Street
#1900
Chicago, IL 60601-1293

Joseph R. Knight
Baker Botts LLP
98 San Jacinto Blvd.
Suite 1500
Austin, TX 78701-4039

Craig A. Knot
Kirkland & Ellis
200 E Randolph Dr Ste 6100
Chicago, IL 60601

Leondra Kruger
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale & Dorr LLP
1875 Pennsylvania NW Avenue
Washington, DC 20006-3642

Melanie G. Lagarde
St. Martin & Williams
4084 Highway 311
Houma, LA 70360

David L. Lawson
Sidley Austin Brown & Wood
1501 K Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20005

1	Roger L. Mandel Stanley Mandel & Iola LLP 3100 Monticello ave Suite 750 Dallas, TX 75205	Harry Rosenberg Phelps Dunbar, LLP Canal Place 365 Canal Street Suite 2000 New Orleans, LA 70130-6534
4	Howard A. Merten Partridge, Snow & Hahn LLP 180 South Main Street Providence, RI 02903	Michael J. Ross Slater Ross 1850 Benjamin Franklin Plaza 1 S.W. Columbia Street Portland, OR 97258
7	Randolph D. Moss Wilmer, Cutler, Pickering, Hale & Dorr LLP 1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20006	William A. Rossbach Rossbach & Whiston 401 North Washington Street P.O. Box 8988 Missoula, MT 59807-8988
9	Michael C. O'Malley Siben & Siben, LLP 90 East Main Street BayShore, NY 11706	Alan Norris Salpeter Mayer, Brown, Rowe & Maw 190 South LaSalle Street Chicago, IL 60603
11	Michele L. Odorizzi Mayer Brown Rowe & Maw 190 South LaSalle Street Chicago, IL 60603	Mark Schlosberg American Civil Liberties Union Fndt. 1663 Mission Street, Suite 460 San Francisco, CA 94103
14	Wendy Sangbee Park Roger Baldwin Foundation of ACLU, Inc. 180 North Michigan Avenue Suite 2300 Chicago, IL 60601	Eric Schneider 1730 South Federal Hwy. #104 Delray Beach, FL 33483
17	Robert J. Patterson Watts Law Firm LLP 555 N. Carancahua Street Twr II Bldg 14th Floor Corpus Christi, TX 78401	Adam D. Schwartz Roger Baldwin Foundation of ACLU, Inc. 180 North Michigan Avenue Suite 2300 Chicago, IL 60601-7401
20	Paul Lee Peyronnin Baker donelson Bearman Caldwell & Berkowitz, PC 201 St. Charles Ave. Suite 3600 New Orleans, LA 70170	Christopher A. Slater Slater & Ross 1 S.W. Columbia Street Suite 1850 Portland, OR 97258
24	Michael James Philippi Ungaretti & Harris LLP 3500 Three First National Plaza Chicago, IL 60602	Michael A. St. Pierre Revens Revens & St. Pierre 946 Centerville Road Warwick, RI 02886
26	Jason S. Ritchie Holland & Hart P.O. Box 639 Billings, MT 59103	

- 1 Marc Ver Der Hout
Ver Der Hout & Brigagliano
- 2 180 Sutter Street, 5th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94123
- 3
- 4 Nicholas Wagner
Law Offices of Wagner & Jones
- 5 1111 East Herndon, Suite 317
Fresno, CA 93720
- 6 Thomas P. Walsh
United States Attorney's Office NDIL
- 7 219 South Dearborn Street
Suite 500
- 8 Chicago, IL 60604
- 9 Peter Wasylyk
Law Offices of Peter Wasylyk
- 10 1307 Chalkstone Avenue
Providence, RI 02908
- 11
- 12 Mikal C. Watts
Watts Law Firm, LLP
- 13 Bank of America Plaza
300 Convent Street
- 14 Suite 100
San Antonio, TX 78205
- 15 Conrad S.P. Williams, III
St. Martin, Williams & Bourque
- 16 P.O. Box 2017
Houma, LA 70361
- 17
- 18 Martin Woodward
Stanley, Mandel & Iola, LLP
- 19 3100 Monticello Avenue
Suite 750
- 20 Dallas, TX 75205
- 21 Matthew A. Woolf
Baker Donelson Bearman Caldwell &
Berkowitz, PC
- 22 201 St. Charles Ave.
Suite 3600
- 23 New Orleans, LA 70170
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28