

Exhibit D

Exhibit D

United States District Court
For the Northern District of California

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN RE: MDL Docket No 06-1791 VRW
NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY ORDER
TELECOMMUNICATIONS RECORDS
LITIGATION

This Document Relates To:

ALL CASES

_____ /

Plaintiffs have moved for an order prohibiting the alteration or destruction of evidence during the pendency of this action. MDL Doc # 384. The United States has filed papers opposing the motion, Doc # 386, and has prepared and lodged with the court a confidential submission designed for ex parte, in camera review. Doc # 387. Telephone company defendants AT&T, Cingular, Bellsouth, Sprint and Verizon have joined in the United States's opposition to plaintiffs' motion. Doc # 365, 388, 390.

Upon careful review of the non-confidential papers submitted in support of and in opposition to the motion, the court

1 has determined that (1) no hearing on the motion is necessary; (2)
2 an order requiring the preservation of evidence is appropriate; and
3 (3) an interim order shall forthwith enter requiring the parties to
4 take steps to prevent the alteration or destruction of evidence as
5 follows:

6 A. Until the issues in these proceedings can be further
7 refined in light of the guidance and directives anticipated to be
8 received upon appellate review of the court's decision in Hepting v
9 AT&T Corporation, 439 F Supp 974 (N D Cal 2006) and of the Oregon
10 district court's decision in Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, Inc v
11 Bush, 451 F Supp 2d 1215 (D Or 2006), the court reminds all parties
12 of their duty to preserve evidence that may be relevant to this
13 action. The duty extends to documents, data and tangible things in
14 the possession, custody and control of the parties to this action,
15 and any employees, agents, contractors, carriers, bailees or other
16 non-parties who possess materials reasonably anticipated to be
17 subject to discovery in this action. Counsel are under an
18 obligation to exercise efforts to identify and notify such non-
19 parties, including employees of corporate or institutional parties.

20 B. "Documents, data and tangible things" is to be
21 interpreted broadly to include writings, records, files,
22 correspondence, reports, memoranda, calendars, diaries, minutes,
23 electronic messages, voicemail, e-mail, telephone message records
24 or logs, computer and network activity logs, hard drives, backup
25 data, removable computer storage media such as tapes, disks and
26 cards, printouts, document image files, web pages, databases,
27 spreadsheets, software, books, ledgers, journals, orders, invoices,
28 bills, vouchers, checks, statements, worksheets, summaries,

United States District Court
For the Northern District of California

1 compilations, computations, charts, diagrams, graphic
2 presentations, drawings, films, digital or chemical process
3 photographs, video, phonographic, tape or digital recordings or
4 transcripts thereof, drafts, jottings and notes. Information that
5 serves to identify, locate, or link such material, such as file
6 inventories, file folders, indices and metadata, is also included
7 in this definition.

8 C. "Preservation" is to be interpreted broadly to
9 accomplish the goal of maintaining the integrity of all documents,
10 data and tangible things reasonably anticipated to be subject to
11 discovery under FRCP 26, 45 and 56(e) in this action. Preservation
12 includes taking reasonable steps to prevent the partial or full
13 destruction, alteration, testing, deletion, shredding,
14 incineration, wiping, relocation, migration, theft, or mutation of
15 such material, as well as negligent or intentional handling that
16 would make material incomplete or inaccessible.

17 D. Counsel are directed to inquire of their respective
18 clients if the business practices of any party involve the routine
19 destruction, recycling, relocation, or mutation os such materials
20 and, if so, direct the party, to the extent practicable for the
21 pendency of this order, either to

- 22 (1) halt such business processes;
- 23 (2) sequester or remove such material from the business
24 process; or
- 25 (3) arrange for the preservation of complete and accurate
26 duplicates or copies of such material, suitable for later discovery
27 if requested.


28 \\
\\

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

The most senior lawyer or lead trial counsel representing each party shall, not later than December 14, 2007, submit to the court under seal and pursuant to FRCP 11, a statement that the directive in paragraph D, above, has been carried out.

The clerk is directed to vacate the hearing now scheduled for November 15, 2007 in this matter.

IT IS SO ORDERED.



VAUGHN R WALKER
United States District Chief Judge

United States District Court
For the Northern District of California